

Transcribed by David Morin

Homwood Avenue  
Calgary  
Alberta

December

Mr J P Brady  
Cross Lake Air Service  
Wabowden  
Manitoba

Dear Mr Brady

Dr Davis has forwarded to me your manuscript The Wisdom of Papasschayo which I have read with great interest. I might say that your name was not unknown to me as I had encountered it during my research on the Metis Association of Alberta. Malcolm Norris also had mentioned your work on behalf of the native people.

As a historian I am obliged to consider any manuscripts in the cold light of recorded facts. While I am sure the traditions of your family have been faithfully recorded in your manuscript they do not completely agree with the official records. For example the arrest of your grandfather is a fascinating account and was entered into the official records and newspapers of the period.

The man involved with your grandfather was Pierre St Germaine not Benjamin Vandal. St Germaine had a farm near the Battle River settlement and was suspected of being a Riel sympathiser. He was arrested on May 11th and when he refused to talk he was told that he would be executed. As a result he confessed and implicated your grandfather Laurent (or Lawrence) Garneau. Your grandfather was arrested on the following day and this is probably why the police knew where to look for incriminating papers. The two men were taken to Fort Saskatchewan and were charged with treason. This was a civil case and the military authorities were never involved. The case had to be tried before a magistrate but Judge Rouleau apparently was afraid to make the trip from Calgary to try the case. As a result both men were released in mid June on their own recognizance. The case was finally brought before Judge Rouleau on August 11th and when no one appeared to prosecute the case was dismissed.

As you will see the legal records are at variance with the family traditions on a number of points particularly the death sentence. It would appear that a death sentence was never issued but was merely used as a means to frighten the man into incriminating others.

The incident regarding railroad construction also is complicated by some historical facts. The Calgary and Edmonton Railway was constructed as far as Red Deer in 1882 and reached Strathcona by July 1882. However the Passpasshase Reserve had been surrendered on November 1882 by three headmen Napasis James Stoney and Antoine. It was considered to be a

"vacant" reserve by \_\_\_\_\_ and at the time of the railroad construction the land already was being sold by auction

The whole matter of the surrender and sale of the Passpasscase Reserve has been a murky one and was likely accompanied by a certain amount of graft and corruption. However, it is still a fact that the Reserve had been legally surrendered by the time the railroad came and that the land was already falling into the hands of white settlers.

As a result of these conflicts between family tradition and recorded information, I would hesitate to use the manuscript in the Alberta Historical Review. I might say that I found the section on your grandfather to be the most interesting part and feel that he probably could be the subject of an interesting paper. I might also say that we have a good photograph of Papasschayo and when I first read the manuscript, I was visualising a number of photographs which would have been suitable to illustrate it.

I am truly sorry that we cannot use the manuscript, but if you have any comments which can change the picture I have presented, I would be most happy to hear them. Also, if you should decide to write anything on the Garneau family or other subjects of Alberta interest, we would appreciate seeing them. Of course, you probably know that historical journals are unable to pay for material they publish, but we do provide a number of complimentary copies to the author.

Sincerely,

Hugh A. Dempsy  
Editor  
Alberta Historical Review

D:gb  
A K Davis